

Evaluation Report of Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR) projects for FY 2012 – 13

“For Merit-cum-Means Scholarship in Patna, Bihar and Mizoram”

Commissioned By: National Buildings Construction Corporation Limited, New Delhi



National Corporate Social Responsibility (NCSR) Hub

Tata Institute of Social Sciences

Mumbai

Acknowledgements

We have undertaken this Proposal Evaluation Study of NBCC's CSR activities for FY 2012 – 13 in partial fulfillment of the TISS-NBCC collaboration.

We express gratitude to Mr. RajendraWanchoo, General Manager (Training & CSR), Mr. B.R. Arora, General Manager (NBCC, Aizawl), Mr. K.K. Ghosh Deputy General Manager (NBCC, Aizawl), Kimi (NBCC), and Jerry, our driver for their support since the beginning till the completion of this study. We thank them for coordinating the study with the Hub's team.

We would also like to thank Mr. Pratap Singh, Country Head (Shrimati Pushpa Wati Loomba Memorial Foundation) and Mr. UdayPratap Singh, Coordinator (Shrimati Pushpa Wati Loomba Memorial Foundation, Patna) for providing the relevant details about the project. We would like to express our heartfelt thanks towards Ms. Aileen Vanlalzawni, Deputy Director (Social Welfare Board, Aizawl, Government of Mizoram) for making the required arrangement to facilitate the Impact Assessment Study.

B. Venkatesh Kumar

Director, NCSR Hub

Tata Institute of Social Sciences

RESEARCH TEAM AT NCSR HUB

Project Director

Dr. B. Venkatesh Kumar

Project Coordinators

Sharvari Joshi

Shreya Majumdar

Documentation

Sharvari Joshi

Shreya Majumdar

Avadh Bihari

Data Collection, Analysis and Report Writing

Sharvari Joshi

Shreya Majumdar

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

List of Abbreviations

Chapter 1: Giving back to the community through CSR.....	7
1.1 Fulfillment of DPE Guideline.....	7
1.2 Need for Impact Assessment.....	7
1.3 MoU between NCSR Hub and NBCC.....	8
1.4 NBCC.....	8
1.5 NCSR Hub.....	9
 Chapter 2: Methodology of the Study.....	 12
2.1 Objectives.....	12
2.2 Research Design.....	12
2.3 Rationale of the Study.....	12
2.4 Methods and Tools of Data Collection.....	13
 Chapter 3: Evaluation of Merit-cum-Means Scholarship Scheme in Bihar and Mizoram..	 14
3.1 Scheme Documents.....	14
3.1.1 Introduction.....	14

3.1.2 Details of the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship Scheme.....	15
3.1.3 Roles and Responsibilities of Stakeholders.....	15
3.1.4 Scheme Beneficiaries.....	16
3.2 SWOT Analysis of the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship.....	16
3.3 Stakeholders' Views.....	18
3.4 Observations of the Research Team.....	20
3.5 Recommendations.....	22
Annexure.....	24

List of Abbreviations

CSR	Corporate Social Responsibility
CPSEs	Central Public Sector Enterprises
NBCC	National Building Constructions Corporation
NCSR Hub	National Corporate Social Responsibility Hub
NGO	Non-Governmental Organisation
TISS	Tata Institute of Social Sciences
DPE	Department of Public Enterprises

Chapter 1

Giving back to the community through CSR

1.1 Fulfillment of DPE Guideline

In order to move towards more responsible business by Central Public Sector Enterprises (CPSEs) under the new regime of Corporate Governance system with the help of Result Documentation Framework, Department of Public Enterprises (DPE), Ministry of Heavy Industries and Public Enterprises, Government of India, has circulated the “Guidelines on Corporate Social Responsibility for Central Public Sector Enterprises” vide F.No.15 (3)/2007 - DPE (GM) - GL-99, 9th April, 2010 for all CPSEs concern. According to the new guideline, it is ensured that, CSR activities should not be limited to charity or done on donation basis, rather it should be visible and make social changes via creating sustainable resource base. The CSR activities should be based on short term, medium term and long term goals so that the impact of the programme can be visible clearly. To ensure consistency in the process of project implementation together with fulfillment of stated objectives, assessment is supposed to be a compulsory ingredient to ensure impact of the ongoing CSR projects.

1.2 Need for Evaluation

According to the new CSR guideline, it is clearly mentioned that

2.3. The long-term Corporate Social Responsibility Plan should match with the long term Business Plan. This should be broken down into medium term and short term plans. Each of these plans should clearly specify: i) Requirements relating to baseline survey; ii) Activities to be

undertaken; iii) Budget allocated; iv) Time-lines prescribed; v) Responsibilities and authorities defined; and vi) Major results expected. [New CSR Guideline, clause 2.3, page 4]

*2.4 Such plans should also clearly specify the implementation guidelines and the involvement of the implementing agency. The procedures and methodologies prescribed for monitoring should be highlighted as well as the modalities of the **concurrent and final evaluation**. Finally, there should be a clear specification regarding mandatory documentation of the experience. [New CSR Guideline, Clause 2.4, page]*

1.3 MoU between NCSR Hub and NBCC

NBCC has signed a MoU with National CSR Hub on 30th November 2012 for the FY 2012 – 13. In this MoU under section 5 it is mentioned that “TISS will evaluate all the upcoming CSR Projects that would be undertaken by NBCC based on which such proposals will be placed before NBCC’s CSR Committee for deliberation. For the FY 2012-13, TISS will specifically take up the following tasks for NBCC - Construction of Road Side Bus stand-.”

Under section 6 “Payment Schedule” it is also mentioned that “ it is agreed between NBCC and TISS that payment of Rs. 10,80,000 would be paid to TISS by NBCC.”

1.4 National Buildings Construction Corporation Limited

NBCC was incorporated in November 1960 as a wholly owned Government of India undertaking under the erstwhile Ministry of Works, Housing & Supply (MoWHS), which is now known as the Ministry of Urban Development (MoUD).

On October 14, 2008, the Government granted NBCC Schedule "A" PSU status. NBCC has also been awarded ISO 9001:2008 from the Bureau of Indian Standards in respect of their consultancy and project management division. NBCC has also received "Excellent" rating from MoUD for each of the Fiscal years from 2004 to 2010 and Ministry of Heavy Industries & Public Enterprises has awarded them with an "Excellence Award". MoUD grants them "Excellent" rating if all the targets set out in the MoU with MoUD for the respective fiscal year are achieved. Further, in 2011, for one of their PMC projects, they were awarded an "Appreciation Shield" for quality and timely completion of NSEZ Noida Project by the Ministry of Commerce & Industry and the Development Commissioner, NSEZ.

NBCC is one of the few public sector companies engaged in the business of (i) project management consultancy services for civil construction projects (PMC) (ii) civil infrastructure for power sector and (iii) real estate development. NBCC is headquartered in New Delhi and in addition has 10 regional / zonal offices across India. The projects undertaken by the Company are spread across 23 states and 1 union territory in India. In addition, NBCC has also have also undertaken projects overseas.

NBCC's PMC business segment includes providing management and consultancy services for a range of civil construction projects including residential and commercial complexes, redevelopment of buildings and colonies, hospitals, educational institutions; infrastructure works for security personnel, border fencing as well as infrastructure projects such as roads, water supply systems, storm water systems and water storage solutions.

NBCC's civil Infrastructure for power sector segment includes providing engineering and construction services for power projects, including design and execution of (i) civil and structural works for power projects (ii) Cooling towers (iii) Chimneys.

NBCC's real estate development segment focuses on principally two types of projects, namely,

(i) residential projects, such as apartments and townships and (ii) commercial projects, such as corporate office buildings and shopping malls.

1.5 National Corporate Social Responsibility Hub

National Corporate Social Responsibility Hub (NCSRH) was created by the DPE under the guidelines for CSR in Tata Institute of Social Sciences (TISS), Mumbai. TISS, a pioneer educational institution in social sciences, was chosen to establish NCSRH by the DPE for its 75 years of experience and expertise of teaching, research, advocacy, capacity building, publications, documentation, and field interventions. The Hub is created to carry out the following tasks:

- Preparation of panels of Agencies for CSR Activity
- Nation-wide compilation, documentation, and creation of database;
- Training and Competency building
- Advocacy; and Research;
- Think Tank; Conferences and Seminars
- Promotional Activities and Dissemination

The NCSRH comprises of a dedicated team working closely and dealing with CPSEs approaching the Hub for the shelf of activities as per the DPE Guidelines on CSR. The major activities are related to Research in which the Hub conducts Need Assessment Studies and

recommends the possible areas of interventions to the CPSEs based on the findings thereof. After receiving recommendations from the Hub, the CPSEs choose from the possible areas of interventions and implement those activities in accordance with their CSR policy and CSR budget allotted for the year. For implementation of the activities, the CPSEs require credible partners in the form of Non-governmental Organizations (NGOs), Trusts, Community-based Organizations etc. For this task, the hub is engaged in a continuous process of empanelling organizations from different states spread across the country. For the purpose, the Hub has an independent team consisting of the faculty from TISS, engaged in scrutinizing the applications of these implementing organizations and shortlist credible organizations on the basis of designed parameters. The Hub also undertakes the Impact Assessment and Evaluation studies for the CPSEs' CSR activities that are undergoing or have been completed even prior to the DPE Guidelines being implemented. The Hub then scrutinizes on-field implementation, effect, benefits and gaps in the programmes and recommends improvements thereof for effectively achieving the programme objectives.

Chapter 2

Methodology of the Study

The study is an Evaluation Study conducted by a team of two research professionals to assess the impact of a scholarship scheme sponsored by the company, NBCC.

2.1 Objectives:

The study objectives were –

- To evaluate the need and feasibility of the project to the beneficiaries
- To examine the implementation and monitoring model of the project
- To understand and assess the impact so far of the project on the beneficiaries and suggest for course corrections wherever required

2.2 Research Design:

The present study adopted an **Explanatory** research design as *“here the researcher begins with ideas about the possible causes of a social phenomenon, i.e., the researcher develops hypotheses before collecting any data.”* This was also an **Evaluation** research as it *“is designed so that the findings will provide information useful in for decisions about public policy or private issues”*.

2.3 Rationale of the Study:

This study was in the background of the need felt and expressed by the receiving agency and further verified and approved by the company authorities. Therefore, the rationale of this study was to evaluate why the project needs to be implemented, whether it is feasible to execute the same, and examine the model of implementation and monitoring so that the project achieves its objectives with transparency and success.

2.4 Methods and Tools of Data Collection:

Being an Explanatory Study and given the nature of the proposals, the researchers used the method of Unstructured Interviews for getting a multi-stakeholder view of the situation. The stakeholders in this project were: student beneficiaries, parents and guardians, school principals and staff, the Social Welfare Board (Govt. of Mizoram), PushpaWatiLoomba Foundation and NBCC. The team interviewed a representative sample of 23 students in each location to get perspective of the benefits realized by students from the Scholarship scheme, sponsored by NBCC.

Apart from the Unstructured Interview, during this study the research team developed a Checklist for evaluation based on the documents for scrutiny (a) Documentation provided and (b) Field verification. It gave clarity whether the company has the relevant documentation in place, if there is proper verification of the proposal previous to this study, if monitoring mechanism is in place and whether the rationale of the project is clear. This is also reflective of the company's seriousness and need towards the project.

Chapter 3

Evaluation of the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship scheme in Bihar and Mizoram

3.1 Scheme Documents

The documents provided by the company include relevant letters of communication and the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) between the NBCC authorities and The PushpaWatiLoomba Foundation, who is the implementing partner for the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship scheme. The Loomba Foundation also provided the list of students provided scholarship from the funds contributed by NBCC.

3.1.1 Introduction

NBCC has been actively engaging in CSR activities of various types for several years. It has proactively recognized needs of target populations, broadly aiming at the socio-economic development of the beneficiaries, and formulated and implemented relevant projects with full commitment. NBCC CSR Policy clearly states its intent, "To establish itself and remain as a responsible corporate entity conscious of its social responsibilities to all stakeholders including the Govt., clientele, share holders, employees, local community and society at large." Its welfare measures adopt an integrated, overall, inclusive, equitable and collective approach. Under its effort to provide education and training to the disadvantaged, backward, minority communities etc., NBCC entered into a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with The PushpaWatiLoomba Foundation to contribute to a Merit-cum-Means Scholarship to 100 students in the states of Bihar and Mizoram each, where the NBCC has been working on infrastructure projects.

3.1.2 Details of the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship Scheme

3.1.2.1 Baseline Survey

The PushpaWatiLoomba Foundation had conducted a baseline survey prior to the implementation of this Scholarship scheme to assess the specific need of the same. The research team is yet to receive details of the same from the Foundation. As per the outcomes of this survey the commencement of the Scholarship scheme was done in March 2012, where the selected students were given the scholarship money for the entire academic year of 2011-2012.

3.1.2.2 Criteria

The criteria for being eligible as a recipient of the NBCC-Loomba Foundation Merit-cum-Means Scholarship scheme (listed in the MoU between the two parties) are as follows:

- i) The student should have scored not less than 50% marks in the previous final exam.
- ii) The student should have atleast 70% attendance in the entire academic year.
- iii) The annual income from all sources, of the student's parent or guardian should not exceed Rs. 100000.
- iv) Being a merit-cum-Means Scholarship, inter-selection weightage is to be given to poverty rather than marks.
- v) The students have to submit a certificate from the Head Master/ Principal of the school where he/she is studying and a proof of family income.

3.1.3 Roles & Responsibilities of Stakeholders

NBCC and The PushpaWatiLoomba Foundation are bounded by a MoU which clearly states the distribution of responsibilities. NBCC provides financial contribution of Rs. 6.00 lakhs towards the Merit-cum-Means Scholarship scheme for 100 student beneficiaries in Bihar and Mizoram respectively. The Loomba Foundation matches up with an equal financial contribution of Rs. 6.00 lakhs to provide the scholarship to another 100 student beneficiaries in each state.

While NBCC is responsible only for the financial contribution, the entire responsibility of executing the scheme is that of The Loomba Foundation. They provide the Fund Utilization Certificate and Quarterly Progress Report to NBCC and are in direct contact with the school principals and students. A person from the Foundation is appointed in Patna, Bihar as the state coordinator and the responsibility for Mizoram rests with the State Social Welfare Board. Officials from NBCC visit the schools at intervals and are also present at the scholarship disbursement ceremonies.

3.1.4 Scheme Beneficiaries

The scheme beneficiaries from this scheme are the students from the Government schools in Patna, Bihar and Private and Government schools across Mizoram. The scheme has also indirectly benefitted the families of these students where the parent/guardian has to make ends meet on a day to day basis and is therefore not able to support the child's education.

3.2 SWOT Analysis

Strengths

The beneficiaries are identified not only on the basis of their economic conditions but also on the

basis of other social factors, like father's death. Beneficiaries receive financial support which they can accordingly spend as per their agenda. Many children feel depressed due to the lack of means to do well academically, even if they have the potential to do so. The provision of this scholarship motivates such students to perform well at their academics and continue to be eligible for the scholarship. It has also helped students to take up many other co-curricular pursuits, like computer classes, buying reference books and dictionaries, to add to their academic learning.

Weaknesses

Students receive the scholarship annually for the last academic year and hence the money is spent for bearing the expenses of the next academic year and in a few cases, on household expenses.

Opportunities

The Scholarship scheme is an excellent instrument to motivate children to perform better academically if it operates as it is envisioned. The scheme has the potential to be extended to children with similarly disadvantaged backgrounds to help them get a chance to complete their schooling and build a better future through productive employment.

Threats

With all the above prospects, the Scholarship scheme also has the threat of becoming a dysfunctional instrument in the absence of regular and rigorous monitoring. The lack of accurate supervision can lead to the scholarships being disbursed to ineligible student beneficiaries and shy away from achieving the envisaged goal of benefitting underprivileged and disadvantaged students wanting to complete their school education.

3.3 Stakeholders' Views

3.3.1 Students

Students have benefitted immensely from this Scholarship scheme both in terms of physical betterment and learning outcomes. Students are able to take care of all their schools expenses like fees, uniforms, notebooks and other stationery, reference books, etc. Students also feel that getting monetary help helps them to plan their expenditure and they can decide their priorities as per their needs, from time to time. Earlier the same students faced the fear of having to discontinue their education in extreme circumstances if their family would not be in a position to support their education. Even if the parent/guardian was able to make enough money to pay the school fees, the students could not buy extra notebooks or textbooks if required. Any other expense like that of exam fees or stationery was difficult. However, few students were also of the opinion that the scholarship could also be provided in kind, like notebooks, reading material for students or other learning aids, like computers, projector sets for audio-visual classes for schools etc. Students could also be provided specific reading material for school level competitive exams like National Talent Search Competitions and so on.

3.3.2 Parents & Family and School Staff

Most children belong to very poor and disadvantaged family backgrounds. The parents of such children are unable to financially support their education, in spite of wanting to educate them to take up well paying jobs and become a productive contributor of the family. The provision of the scholarship has helped take off some financial burden from the parent or guardian. The families and school staff are of the opinion that the scholarship should be extended to such children who satisfy the criteria for getting the scholarship but are not receiving it since their elder sibling is a beneficiary. Thus all the children belonging to the family with a widowed mother should also be eligible for the scholarship and not just one child per family.

3.3.3 Social Welfare Board, Aizawl, Mizoram

The social welfare board has been imparted with the responsibility to distribute the scholarships to eligible students across Mizoram. While the Board has been impartial in doing its job, it needs continuous support from the Foundation and the company to ensure that students receive financial support for academic purposes. The Social Welfare Board would also like to extend financial support of this nature to other students from similarly disadvantaged backgrounds.

3.3.4 The Pushpa Wati Loomba Foundation

The Loomba foundation has been engaged in welfare work for widows since its inception. Thus extending its welfare work to the children of widows was a meaningful and well thought initiative. The Foundation made this a feasible effort by introducing a scholarship scheme for students with a deceased father and meeting certain other criteria. The Foundation has expressed that a genuine funding support from NBCC has helped them achieve their desired target and a continued association with the company can ensure that the needy get the much required financial support for their academic and physical betterment.

3.3.5 NBCC

As a Public Sector Enterprise, NBCC has undertaken various CSR initiatives to benefit the community in the true sense. However, the company believes that education is an important area of intervention where the company has the potential to extend financial help to ensure that children coming from disadvantaged background continue their education and do not discontinue it in account of lack of financial resources. The nature of scholarship is such that students inducted in Class VIII are continued upto Class XII, to guarantee that they complete their schooling for their better future. While agreeing that there is scope for improvement, the company also feels that a noble cause of supporting disadvantaged children's education will help in improving their societal status and instilling confidence in them to acquire gainful

employment. The company also intends to extend the scholarships to students who pass Class XII with distinction but may not have sufficient funds to get admission in professional courses.

3.4 Observations of the Research Team

The research team of the NCSR Hub visited the schools and met the student beneficiaries of the said Scholarship scheme, both in Patna and in Aizawl. It interviewed the various stakeholders to get a holistic picture of the scheme in operation. The observations of the team are as follows:

- The benefits of the scholarship scheme are available to students from Government as well as Private Schools. (Mizoram)
- The benefits of the scholarship scheme are available to students with widowed mothers, whether they meet the other criteria of academic performance and/or attendance or not. (Patna & Mizoram)
- The benefits of the scholarship scheme are available to students who are simultaneously the beneficiaries of other scholarships like that provided by the Government. (Patna)
- The students belong to families with annual income below Rs. One lakh, but doing reasonably well as the mothers of most students have got compensatory jobs in the same place of work as their husband, after their death.
- Evaluation and monitoring mechanisms are not in place as there is lack of dedicated personnel to keep a track of the performance of students and the implementation of the scheme.

The following table represents the views of the various stakeholders on the different parameters, as observed by the team:

	Criteria for beneficiaries	Nature of Support	Monitoring & Feedback
Students	Criteria are appropriate but need more strict implementation	Some in favour of financial support and some want it in kind like books or supporting materials	Strict monitoring required to ensure benefits reaching appropriate beneficiaries
Parents & School Staff	Criteria appropriate but should include if there is more than one child in the family	Existing support to be continued while funding could be given even to improve existing or further add infrastructure in schools	Strict monitoring and regular feedback sessions should be conducted so that improvements or course corrections can be made if required
Social Welfare Board, Aizawl, Mizoram	Criteria should be extended to children from other underprivileged backgrounds	Existing support to be continued in the same form and extended to larger number of students	Strict monitoring and regular feedback sessions required for communication between funders and implementing partners

The Loomba Foundation	Criteria appropriate and decided after conducting baseline survey	Current nature of support identified as best in the prevalent conditions and also given the other constraints	Monitoring mechanisms in place but may require more rigorous implementation
NBCC	Criteria appropriate but would be interested in extending to other students in the future	Current financial support would be continued but would be interested in extending support in other ways	Monitoring mechanisms in place but require more rigorous implementation

3.5 Recommendations

- Rigorous institutional mechanisms need to be put in place for monitoring of the Scholarship scheme at regular intervals. A dedicated team for day to day field implementation, especially in Aizawl, from the implementing partner is required. At the same time the company (NBCC) needs to actively participate in the monitoring of the scheme.
- The criteria set in the MoU for selecting the eligible students to become beneficiaries of the said Scholarship scheme have to be implemented in letter and spirit.
- Funding support from the company's side (NBCC) has to be continued without any interruption and should be increased if possible. The number of students supported by the scholarship in 2011-12 was 100 students at each location and it was reduced to 50 students in the year 2012-13.

- Along with sponsoring scholarships to eligible students, the company (NBCC) can also distribute funds in the nature of one-time grants to schools for improving infrastructure support to the students for improved academic outcomes, like benches, black/white boards, audio-visual aids etc. Being an expert in construction, the company could also undertake construction of infrastructure like classrooms, toilets etc in schools that are in dire need of the same.
- The Company (NBCC) can also provide financial support for vocational training for those students who wish to take up such professional courses after their secondary education, like diplomas and certificate courses at ITI or similar institutions.
- The company (NBCC) could bring out a booklet containing profiles of better performing students which would incentivize other students to aim high and perform well. A gathering of all students receiving the scholarship could be organized along with seminars and competitions to give the students more exposure and to boost their confidence.

ANNEXURE

PATNA

Sr. No.	Name of the Student	Name of the School	Current Class
1.	Dolly Kumari	Ravindra Balika Vidyalaya	X
2.	Suman Kumari	Ravindra Balika Vidyalaya	X
3.	Pooja Kumari	Ravindra Balika Vidyalaya	X
4.	Pooja Kumari	Govt. High School Kankarbagh	IX
5.	Varsha Kumari	Govt. Middle School Lohanipur	IX
6.	Choti Kumari	Bapu Smarak Balika Madhya Vidhyalaya Kadamkuan	VIII
7.	Gunja Kumari	Bapu Smarak Balika Madhya Vidhyalaya Kadamkuan	VIII
8.	Julee Kumari	Manorama Vidyapeeth Balika High School	VIII
9.	Kaushalya Kumari	Manorama Vidyapeeth Balika High School	IX
10.	Rinky Kumari	Government Middle School Lohanipur	VIII
11.	Radha Kumari	Kanya Madhya Vidyalaya Birchand Patel	VIII

AIZAWL

Sr. No.	Name of the Student	Name of the School	Current Class
1.	Babyzonunsangi	Govt. Zotlang Middle School	IX
2.	Lalnunziri	Govt. Zotlang Middle School	IX
3.	Vanlalhriatpuii	Royal Standard School	IX
4.	LalruatkimiNgente	Royal Standard School	X
5.	Lalramlawmi	Synod Higher Secondary School	X
6.	LalnunTluangi	Holy Child School	X
7.	Ramdinthari	T S High School Hnahthial	IX
8.	Laldingliani	Govt. Vengthlang Middle School	IX
9.	J.H. Zohmingliani	Presbyterian School	X
10.	Laltanpuii	Presbyterian School	X
11.	Vanlalchhanhimi	Rosebud English School	IX
12.	Esther Lalawmpvii	Govt. Middle School II Bawngkawn	IX